

Scott and Linda Roberts  
80 Elladale Road APPIN NSW 2560  
E: [scott.t.roberts@optusnet.com.au](mailto:scott.t.roberts@optusnet.com.au)  
M: 0402031874

19 December 2022

**Submission by Scott and Linda Roberts (80 Elladale Road APPIN) to the New South Wales Department of Planning and Environment**

**Re: Appin Precinct Planning Proposal Exhibition**

**Reference PP2022-3279**

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

- **We are not adverse to the development of Appin however it needs to be developed to be a desirable place to live with a diversity of appealing recreation space and community facilities.**
- **We object to the current proposed location of the Bulk Supply Point of Power (BSP).**
- **Greater consideration in the Master Planning process and the approval process by the NSW Department of Planning and Environment is required to be given to the historical significance of Elladale and Elladale Cottage.**
- **The impact to Private Landholders of the proposal needs to be considered.**

### **DETAILED SUBMISSION**

We have detailed below our comments and concerns regarding the current Appin Planning Proposal.

#### **1. DEVELOPMENT OF APPIN/ELLADALE**

After having lived in Appin for most of our lives we are passionate about making sure any development will maintain Appin as a desirable and aesthetic location to live in with all available amenities.

We are aware Appin was earmarked as part of the original Three Cities of Campbelltown, Camden & Appin 1973. We do not object to the development per se but maintain that it should be developed properly with all facilities provided as it is developed not at some later date and altered prior to delivery.

Useable open spaces are required to make it a desirable location to live in. This means not overgrown biodiversity space but areas where residents can share and enjoy. Areas of bushland would be greatly used with both cycleways and walkways to create further recreation areas and make the whole of Appin an appealing area to live in. This would require clearing of undergrowth in the biodiversity land or just selective thinning of scrub to make the bushland accessible and usable Existing natural and heritage features need to be protected and enhanced as features.

There is a need to cater for all residential purposes, including lifestyle living on larger blocks of land, gated communities, some medium density and encourage the use of higher density when close to public transport facilities. Any public housing must be incorporated into the residential areas as a small percentage of blended housing so as not to make large ghetto type estates that become detrimental to social function and community integration in Appin.

## **2. BULK SUPPLY POINT OF POWER (BSP)**

### **REASONS NOT TO BE IN PROPOSED LOCATION**

#### **2.1 Visual and health impact to Elladale**

There are only a handful of properties retaining links to Appin's original Colonial Heritage remaining. It would be extremely detrimental to situate a BSP in front of our property Elladale when many other sites to both the north and south exist with no visual or sterilizing impact on land suitable for urban development. It is said to cover 26,000 m<sup>2</sup> which is a huge structural exposure. As with most historical properties, Elladale is situated on a hill with a commanding view overlooking Razorback and the Blue Mountains. We consider it insulting to place a BSP/substation as the main view to front of our historical property as we would be looking directly into the entire BSP site. Any site for a BSP should be placed near industrial type developments and well away from residential locations. A 26,000m<sup>2</sup> BSP will have negative stigma, noise and electromagnetic issues which reduce desirability to live within close proximity of it. Property values would also be drastically reduced.

Our investigation into the location of existing BSP's shows they are located adjoining industrial estates or in open spaces. They are not located near/next to residential areas.

#### **2.2 Valuation impact**

Walker Corporation (the "developer") has substantial landholdings in Appin and to place the BSP directly in front of one of the few private landholdings not owned by the developer is insulting. It would devalue our land holding significantly especially when it was our discussion/submission and lobbying with the NSW Department of Planning and Environment during submissions related to The Greater Macarthur Plan 2040 which now has allowed the area surrounding Elladale, owned by the developer, to be included in the urban development.

We recently sought advice from a staff member of the developer regarding the proposed location of the BSP. They acknowledged our concerns and indicated the proposed location warrants further investigation as part of the Master Planning process with a view to finding an alternative location. However, it will continue to remain a significant concern to us until we get a clear indication it has been officially relocated.

Major Power upgrades have been undertaken during November and December 2022 by Transgrid and private contractors on the HV transmission lines in the Appin area. Is this an upgrade for the proposed Appin development that is occurring prior to the project being approved?

#### **2.3 Scar Tree**

There is a listed indigenous scar tree directly in the center of the area indicated to be the BSP location. We bring this to notice of Walker Corporation and the NSW Department of Planning to allow these parties to conduct due diligence regarding the proposed location of the BSP site. The tree is situated approximately at lat 34.19893 deg S, Lon 150.75767 deg E approximately 100m North from the bottom of Elladale driveway and approximately 50m East of the electrical easement. The scar tree is approximately 1350mm diameter and 4250mm circumference.

We were informed in approximately 2006 the tree was already recorded as an historical Scar Tree and was further recorded by Aboriginal Elder Allan Carriage (now deceased) about this date.

## **2.4 Heritage Site**

We acknowledge the heritage value of Elladale Cottage and the local significance it offers to the township of Appin. It is listed as of local significance to the Wollondilly Shire area. We note that other historical properties including Teston Farm owned by the developer have not even been noted as a historical site on the plans even though it is one of the oldest remaining dwellings in Appin and has Indigenous graves on the property. We encourage the NSW Department of Planning to embrace the remaining heritage properties in any future development.

## **3. MAJOR IMPACTS TO PRIVATE LANDHOLDERS**

We acknowledge the developer Walker Corporation has been able to acquire a large landholding in the Appin area over many years with an obvious view of future development. There is some admiration for the ability to have done so, however no developer should have the ability to purposefully dictate the location of infrastructure and roads with the intent to severely impact the small number of residential landholders with acreages that are still privately owned. Is this a way to push all the small private acreage landholders out of the picture? An example is the roads passing through most small acreage properties on Macquariedale Road and some on Brooks Point Road effectively sterilizing them for development. Our property Elladale is also majorly impacted on the plans with the BSP covering 26,000 m<sup>2</sup> directly in front of the property which would significantly devalue the property and reduce future realisation of the property, whatever form that takes.

## **4. CURTILEGE AND FUTURE PRIVATE OR COMMUNITY USAGE OF ELLADALE**

We understand there would need to be a curtilage around Elladale Cottage to allow it to still be enjoyed as a visual link to Appin's rich historical past.

As the dwelling is on the northeastern corner of the property owned by us, we would encourage a curtilage of somewhere between 1200m<sup>2</sup> and 1500m<sup>2</sup> for Elladale Cottage. This would ensure the visual protection and allow for appropriate future usage for whoever develops the property. The property could be used for a variety of purposes from a residential property to a commercial purpose as part of a Country Club facility such as Club Menangle where I have worked on the heritage buildings adjoining the Club facility. Alternatively, it could be a restaurant, high tea house, whisky bar, professional offices etc.

Any dwellings in the first row of houses to the immediate West and North of Elladale Cottage should be of single-story construction on lifestyle blocks so the property can maintain the higher views it currently commands and so it can be seen and appreciated by others and not swallowed up by development. It is important to provide areas for social integration for the community especially in a new development and Elladale Cottage may facilitate this in the future.

In an earlier submission to the NSW Department of Planning for the Greater Macarthur Plan we proposed that some areas within the Appin proposal, including Elladale, should still encourage lifestyle type blocks of between 700 and 1000m, whether on all or on some of the property with a mixture of smaller or heritage style terrace buildings for people downsizing. Some larger blocks will give families a more generous space and soften the impact of overdevelopment on this area as it is clearly a unique location being situated in such a unique panoramic and biodiverse space.

## **5. GATED COMMUNITY**

The location of Elladale provides an excellent opportunity to create a gated community as it is bordered by the biodiversity bushland along Elladale and Simpsons Creeks as well an electrical easement to the west on the lower ground. There is a gated style community at Macquarie Links with a golf course or the overseas development Serenbe in Atlanta that has enhanced its heritage properties. The subsequent development noted above provides an alternate type of secure residential area and private lifestyle. Both of which are very rare and highly sought after.

## **6. LAND ACCESS**

There are proposed public playing fields west of Elladale bordered by the Heritage listed Sydney Upper Canal. This area is also bordered by Elladale and Simpsons Creek's and an electrical Easement. I would argue this area may be better used for a golf course rather than ovals as this would have less impact on the protection of the biodiverse land adjoining the cleared area. Alternatively further lifestyle type properties in the Elladale Road area would protect not just the biodiverse land but the heritage significance of The Sydney Upper Canal.

If the playing fields are to go ahead in the currently proposed location at the North Western end of Elladale Road, it is in our view, essential to maintain the existing use of Elladale Road as the access to the playing fields with a separate road accessing the residential development around Elladale Cottage. This will serve several important points. The road being used as the second access to evacuate the area as part of a bushfire survival plan. Additionally, it would limit the impacts on Elladale and the suburb to constant through traffic and become a border to the Elladale area facilitating it to be created as a gated type of development.

## **7. SUBURBAN NAMES**

We believe there is an opportunity to provide Elladale as a name for the suburb where the property is located. Appin is in fact the fifth oldest colony in Australia, predating many other historical settlements and towns. Appin was discovered very early during colonial settlement in the late 1700's. Appin was officially settled in 1811. It is very important that the Heritage link is both protected and supported in any proposed development.

## **8. BUILDING COVENANTS**

We are happy to encourage that any development around Elladale may have some covenants as to style of building and the materials may be used for construction. Several developments have incorporated building style covenants in areas to maintain a cohesive feel rather than a free for all type development where designs of houses are not well integrated. Bingara Gorge at Wilton and developments in Menangle and elsewhere have done this with success.

## **9. UNREASONABLE TIMEFRAME FOR SUBMISSIONS**

We would like to state that the timeframes given for such important submissions to the NSW Department of Planning are ridiculously short. Our letter with the Appin Precinct Proposal Exhibition was dated the 21 November 2022 however we did not receive it until 28 November 2022. The submission was then required to be lodged 19 December 2022. To access and read the proposal that has obviously taken years for the developer to prepare, totaling over 500 pages and then to prepare a submission right on the eve of Christmas is extremely hard for many people.

It is an unreasonable request. The extension to 21 December 2022 (2 days) to lodge a submission is also unreasonable.

We suggest that an extension for all effected Appin landholders should be at least available until the end of January 2023 or is there another agenda with such short deadlines for submissions?

If you would like to discuss our submission further, please do not hesitate to contact Scott on 0402031874.

Yours sincerely

Scott and Linda Roberts